



Portfolio Management Strategies: Comparative Study of Mutual Funds vs. Direct Equity

Shivani Zunje, H. R. Kulkarni, Snehal V. Sinalkar*

G. H. Raisonni College of Arts, Commerce and Science, Wagholi, Pune, Maharashtra, India

*Author For Correspondence Email: snehaldalvi28@gmail.com

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.56975/jetir.v13i3.576776>

Abstract

This descriptive study examines the portfolio management strategies adopted by individual investors by comparing Mutual Funds (MFs) and Direct Equity (DE) investments. Portfolio management is essential for achieving financial goals while minimizing risk, and investors commonly allocate funds to these two prominent avenues. Mutual funds offer professional management, diversification, and lower risk, appealing to cautious or beginner investors. Direct equity, while carrying higher volatility and risk, provides the potential for superior returns and full investor control.

The research utilized a structured questionnaire to collect primary data from a sample of 100 small and medium investors in urban areas of India, employing a convenience sampling method. Key objectives included comparing risk and return, studying investor behavior, and assessing financial literacy. The study hypothesized that mutual fund investors are more risk-averse, direct equity investors expect higher profits, and greater financial knowledge correlates with a preference for direct equity.

Analysis of the data revealed a balanced risk appetite among investors, with a slight preference for Direct Equity as the most preferred investment type (38%). A majority (58%) of respondents expressed a preference for self-managed equity over professional fund management, indicating confidence in personal decision-making. The majority of investors track their portfolios weekly and understand the importance of diversification. The conclusion emphasizes the value of a combined strategy for a balanced portfolio, where mutual funds offer stability and direct equity offers capital growth opportunities. Recommendations stress the need to diversify, regularly assess risk tolerance, and invest for the long term.

Key Words

Portfolio Management, Mutual Funds, Direct Equity, Risk and Return, Investor Behavior, Financial Literacy, Diversification.

Introduction

Portfolio management is the strategic and structured process of managing investments to achieve specific financial goals while concurrently minimizing risk. It encompasses planning, organizing, and monitoring investments to align them with an investor's goals, risk tolerance, and financial situation. Two of the most prominent avenues for fund allocation today are mutual funds and direct equity.

Mutual Funds pool money from numerous investors and are managed by professional fund managers. They invest in a diversified mix of stocks, bonds, or other instruments, which helps in reducing individual investment risk and is ideal for those seeking professional guidance. **Direct Equity**, conversely, involves an investor buying shares of individual companies, offering high potential returns but exposing the investor to high volatility and market fluctuations.

Choosing between these options depends on an investor's risk appetite and financial objectives. This study aims to compare mutual funds and direct equity from a portfolio management perspective, examining factors such as returns, risk, diversification, and investor preferences. The research provides crucial insights to help investors, particularly beginners, make informed decisions and achieve steady financial growth.

Literature Review

The field of portfolio management has seen extensive scholarly work on the dynamics of risk, return, and investor behavior, particularly concerning mutual funds and direct equity. Foundational texts, such as **Bhalla, V. K.'s *Investment Management: Security Analysis and Portfolio Management* (S. Chand, 2020)** and **Chandra, P.'s *Investment Analysis and Portfolio Management* (McGrawHill Education, 2022)**, have established the core principles of diversification and security analysis.

Studies on Mutual Funds

Mutual funds are popular due to their professional management and diversification. Studies have shown that:

- Mutual funds provide stable returns because they spread investments across many assets. Research by **Kumar and Sharma (2019)** found that mutual funds give stable returns and that investors with limited stock market knowledge prefer mutual funds.

- The use of Systematic Investment Plans (SIPs) in mutual funds facilitates regular, small investments, leading to steady wealth growth, as studied by **Rao (2020)**.
- Investors choose mutual funds primarily due to trust in fund managers, ease of investment, and lower risk, according to the findings of **Singh (2017)**.

Studies on Direct Equity

Direct equity offers higher returns but with greater risk. Key observations include:

- Investors with high-risk tolerance can earn more through direct equity, but success requires knowledge, company performance analysis, and regular monitoring, as observed by **Mehta and Joshi (2021)**.
- **Sharma (2018)** analyzed the balance between risk and returns in direct equity, concluding that experienced investors who select stocks carefully can outperform mutual funds, but beginners often suffer losses.
- Comparative analysis by **Patel (2019)** established that direct equity is significantly more volatile than mutual funds over the long term, demanding patience and strategy.

Comparative Studies

Comparative research has established clear distinctions between the two investment options:

- **Sharma and Verma (2020)** concluded that mutual funds are safer and better suited for beginners due to professional management and diversification.
- **Khan and Ahmed (2021)** found that investor preferences are influenced by simplicity and safety (for mutual funds) versus higher returns (for direct equity), with financial literacy being a key factor.
- A recent comparative study by **Kaur, G., & Sharma, R. (2023)**, published in the *Journal of Financial Markets and Policy*, further highlighted the differing investment behaviors of risk-averse and risk-tolerant investors.

The consensus from the literature is that mutual funds are a relatively safer option, whereas direct equity is suitable for informed investors willing to embrace higher risk for potentially superior returns. Investor behavior, knowledge, and risk tolerance are strong determinants of investment choices.

Research Methodology

Research Design

The study adopts a **descriptive research design**. This design is appropriate as it helps detail investor preferences, behavior, and the characteristics of mutual fund and direct equity investors.

Sources of Data

A. Primary Data

Primary data was collected directly from investors to understand their perceptions, preferences, and behavior.

- **Target Group:** Individual investors in mutual funds, direct equity, or both, primarily small and medium investors from urban areas in India.
- **Sample Size:** 100 respondents selected using a **convenience sampling** method.
- **Data Collection Tool:** A structured questionnaire was designed to gather data on investment preference, risk appetite, factors influencing decisions, financial literacy, and investor satisfaction.
- **Method of Collection:** Questionnaires were distributed both online and offline.

B. Secondary Data

Secondary data was gathered to provide quantitative and background information, including:

- Books, research papers, and journals on portfolio management, risk, and returns.
- Reports from financial institutions, mutual fund companies, stock market websites, and regulatory bodies like SEBI. This data was used to understand past trends, compare historical returns, and validate findings from the primary data.

Questionnaire

A structured questionnaire consisting of 40 questions was used to collect primary data, categorized into four main sections.

Investor Profile (Questions 1-10)

Gathers demographic and basic investment background:

- Age, Gender, Occupation, Education Level, Annual Income.
- Investment Experience (Years), Primary Financial Goal, Preferred Investment Horizon.

Investment Preferences (Questions 11-20)

Focuses on investment choices and risk tolerance:

- Investment in Mutual Funds/Direct Equity (Yes/No).

- Preferred Investment Type (MF/DE/Both).
- Risk Appetite (Low/Medium/High).
- Consultation with a financial advisor, Satisfaction level (1-5 scale).

Risk Perception and Returns (Questions 21-30)

Assesses the perception of risk and expectations:

- Expected annual return from Mutual Funds and Direct Equity.
- Perception of Mutual Fund Risk and Direct Equity Risk (Low/Medium/High).
- Comfort with potential loss in direct equity and preference for short-term/long-term investments.
- Tracking portfolio regularly and diversification across asset classes.

Behavioral and Knowledge-Based Questions (Questions 31-40)

Measures financial literacy and behavioral factors:

- Consideration of past performance before investing.
- Frequency of reading financial news and use of online investment platforms.
- Belief in professional fund management vs. self-managed equity.
- Awareness of tax implications and investment based on recommendations from family/friends.

Objectives of the Study

The main goal of the study is to understand and compare portfolio management strategies between mutual funds and direct equity investments. The specific objectives are:

1. To compare mutual funds and direct equity as investment options.
2. To study investor preferences and behavior (e.g., risk appetite, knowledge, goals).
3. To evaluate risk and return associated with both investment options.
4. To assess the level of financial literacy among investors.
5. To identify factors influencing investment decisions (e.g., safety, liquidity, tax benefits).
6. To analyze investor satisfaction and perception of performance.
7. To provide recommendations for better portfolio management for individual and beginner investors.

Hypothesis of the Study

The research is guided by the following five hypotheses:

1. **H1:** People who invest in mutual funds are generally more careful and prefer lower risk compared to those who invest in direct equity.
2. **H2:** Investors think differently about returns in mutual funds and direct equity; Direct equity investors expect higher profits, while mutual fund investors are satisfied with moderate and steady growth.
3. **H3:** People who know more about finance and the stock market are more likely to invest in direct equity than in mutual funds.
4. **H4:** Investor satisfaction varies depending on the type of investment, reflecting how well the option meets personal goals.
5. **H5:** A person's willingness to take risks affects their choice of investment; Risk-takers prefer direct equity, while conservative investors prioritize safety and choose mutual funds.



Data Collection and Interpretation

The analysis of data collected from 100 respondents provided the following key insights:

Investor Profile and Goals

- **Occupation:** The majority of respondents were salaried (50%), followed by self-employed (30%), indicating that working individuals are the most active investors.
- **Income and Experience:** The majority (80%) earned above ₹5 lakh annually. Most investors (75%) had more than two years of investment experience, reflecting a moderately experienced investor base.
- **Financial Goal & Horizon:** Financial goals were primarily focused on wealth growth and tax saving (28% each). Most investors (36%) preferred a medium-term investment horizon.

Investment Preferences and Risk

- **Investment Type:** Investment in mutual funds and direct equity was equally split (50% each). However, when asked for their preference, Direct Equity was the most preferred investment type (38%), followed by those preferring 'Both' (32%), and Mutual Funds (30%). This slight preference for direct equity suggests a moderate-to-high risk investment tendency in the sample.
- **Risk Appetite and Perception:** The risk appetite of the sample was balanced, with medium-risk being the most preferred (36%), followed closely by high-risk (34%).
- **Mutual Fund Risk:** Most perceived mutual fund risk as Low (38%) or Medium (36%).

- **Direct Equity Risk:** A majority (40%) perceived direct equity risk as High, with 36% viewing it as Medium.
- **Diversification and Management:** A significant majority (66%) of respondents confirmed they diversify their portfolios across asset classes. Furthermore, 58% of investors did *not* believe that professional fund management is better than self-managed equity, indicating high confidence in their own market knowledge and decision-making.

Comparative Analysis Summary

Parameters	Mutual Funds	Direct Equity
Risk	Moderate	High
Return	Moderate	High
Liquidity	High	Moderate
Expertise Required	Low	High
Diversification	High	Low

Performance Data:

- **Mutual Funds:** Equity mutual funds showed average annual returns of 10–12% (moderate risk), with debt funds yielding 6–7% (lower volatility).
- **Direct Equity:** Direct equity returns were highly volatile, ranging from -10% to 25% annually, with higher returns achieved by knowledgeable investors.

Conclusion

Effective portfolio management is central to successful investing. The comparative study of Mutual Funds and Direct Equity reveals that investment choices are fundamentally driven by an investor's **risk tolerance** and **financial knowledge**.

- **Investor Types:** Risk-averse investors who prioritize safety and predictability find mutual funds a suitable option due to professional management and risk-spreading diversification. Conversely, risk-tolerant and experienced investors are drawn to direct equity for its higher potential returns.
- **Risk and Return:** While mutual funds offer stable and consistent growth, direct equity provides opportunities for significant capital appreciation, though with greater volatility.
- **Preference for Self-Management:** The finding that a majority of investors prefer self-managed equity suggests growing confidence and an increasing level of financial literacy in the investor base, enabling them to pursue potentially higher-risk, higher-return strategies.

- **Combined Strategy:** The most robust strategy involves a well-balanced portfolio that includes both mutual funds (for stability) and direct equity (for growth). This combined approach allows investors to maximize the benefits of diversification while aligning their portfolio with changing market conditions, personal goals, and risk levels.

Successful investing is a continuous process that requires regular monitoring, timely adjustments, and informed decision-making over simply choosing an asset class.

Recommendations

Based on the study's findings, the following recommendations are provided for better portfolio management:

1. **Diversify Across Asset Classes:** Investors should maintain a balanced mix of mutual funds and direct equity. This strategy minimizes risks, optimizes returns, and protects against market volatility.
2. **Assess Risk Tolerance Regularly:** Risk appetite is dynamic and changes with age, income, and financial goals. Periodic review ensures that the investment strategy remains suitable and realistic for the investor's current situation.
3. **Set Clear Financial Goals:** Every investment should be tied to a specific objective (e.g., retirement, education). Clear goals guide asset allocation and maintain focus on long-term outcomes.
4. **Invest for the Long Term:** Both mutual funds and equities yield superior results when held over an extended period, allowing the powerful effect of compounding and enabling recovery from market corrections.
5. **Seek Professional Guidance When Needed:** Investors lacking time or expertise should consider consulting certified financial advisors to enhance decision-making and avoid emotional or uninformed investment choices.
6. **Stay Updated on Market Trends:** Understanding economic indicators and policy changes is essential for making timely adjustments and capturing opportunities during market shifts.

References

1. Bhalla, V. K. (2020). Investment Management: Security Analysis and Portfolio Management. S. Chand, New Delhi.
2. Chandra, P. (2022). Investment Analysis and Portfolio Management (6th ed.). McGrawHill Education, New Delhi.

3. Kaur, G., & Sharma, R. (2023). Investment Behavior of Risk-Averse and Risk-Tolerant Investors: A Comparative Study. *Journal of Financial Markets and Policy*, 15(2), 45–58.
4. Investopedia. (2024). Mutual Funds vs. Stocks: Which is Better for You? Retrieved from <https://www.investopedia.com>
5. Morningstar. (2024). The Importance of Portfolio Diversification. Morningstar Research Reports. Retrieved from [suspicious link removed]
6. Securities and Exchange Board of India (SEBI). (2024). Investor Education and Protection Guidelines. Retrieved from <https://www.sebi.gov.in>
7. Financial Express. (2024). How to Build a Balanced Investment Portfolio. Retrieved from <https://www.financialexpress.com>

